

Structure and dynamics of private health sector

Implications for India's Health Policy

Prasanta Mahapatra

P. Sridhar

K.T. Rajshree

Institute of Health Systems
Hyderabad

Copyright © Institute of Health Systems

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted or utilised in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without permission in writing from the Publishers.



Institute of Health Systems

HACA Bhavan, Hyderabad, AP - 500 004, India

Ph: 91-40-3210136/9,3211013/4; Fax:91-40-3241567

Email: ih@ih.net.org.in; <http://www.ih.net.org.in>

Printed in Hyderabad, 2002

IHS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Structure and Dynamics of Private Health Sector. Implications for India's health policy. 1st Edition\Prasanta Mahapatra, Sridhar and Rajshree

ISBN 81 - 7934 - 011-2

Includes bibliographic references

1. Structure and Dynamics of Private Health Sector 2. Motivations and Establishment - India 3. Financial Aspects - India 4. Policy Recommendations - India 5. Study

I. Prasanta Mahapatra II. Sridhar III. Rajshree

At the time of publication in 2002, the Institute of Health System was located in HACA Bhavan, Hyderabad, AP - 500 004, India. In November 2021, the Institute of Health Systems shifted to its present location in Sivananda Rehabilitation Home Campus, Kukatpally, Hyderabad 500072.

INR: 500/-
US \$ 50

Preface

We are happy to present the report of the study on Structure and Dynamics of the private health sector. The study is based on data on private and public health care institutions in Andhra Pradesh. To address the policy concerns raised at the beginning of the study, we have supplemented findings from the field study with review of literature from India and abroad. The study was commissioned by the Government of India Ministry of Health¹ and funded by The World Bank².

The study was commissioned in August 1999 and was expected to be complete by April 2000. Unfortunately the study has taken more time than we had planned. Various factors are responsible. The data collection from private health care institutions, many of which do not practice systematic recording of information took longer than we had anticipated. In many cases we had to revisit the health care institutions to further clarify obvious inconsistency in information collected during the first round of the survey. The study involved collection of data in six different questionnaires. Summarising the information and data analysis took much more time than we had planned. Our study resources and time constraint did not permit collection of information on all policy issues of concern. So we had to review the literature and search for evidence and information on many of these policy questions. We feel the wait is worth the result. The extra time has allowed us to present a more comprehensive report. We hope that the report will meet the requirement of the Central Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Departments of Health in various State Governments in general and the Government of Andhra Pradesh in particular.

We are grateful to Ms Sujatha Rao, Joint Secretary to Government of India for her encouragement and support. The help and support from Dr. David Peters, and Dr. GNV Ramana at the World Bank Delhi office was crucial in designing and implementation of the study. We also benefited from discussions with

¹Demi Official Letter No. M11035/7/99-BP from Sujatha Rao, Joint Secretary to GOI MOHFW, dated 14 May 1999, and 11 June 1999. DGHS Letter No. M11035/7/99-BP dated 21 June 1999.

²World Bank, Institutional Procurement Unit, Room 12-022, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC20433, USA Purchase Order No. 7108827.

other investigators, who participated in various aspects of a set of studies on private health sector simultaneously commissioned by the Government of India with funding from the World Bank. These are; (a) VR Muraleedharan, at Foundation for Sustainable Development, Indian Institute of Technology, Chennai; (b) Sunil Nandaraj, at the Centre for Enquiry into Health and Allied Themes, Mumbai (c) Rama V. Baru, at the Centre for Social Medicine and Community Health, JNU, Delhi, (d) Prof. S. Chakraborty at the Indian Institute of Management (IIM), Lucknow. All the above persons participated in a workshop at the Institute of Health System from 15-16 February, 2000, to help us develop the study design. We are grateful to Prof. Chakaraborty and his team at the IIM Lucknow, who organised a workshop in their campus from 20-21 September, 2000, to facilitate the data analysis process.

Implementation of the study involved a team of people in IHS and help of many other people. In addition to the effort of the team members, collaborators and others listed at the end of the report, we would like to thank all the health care institutions, owners, managers and their personnel for their help in providing us with information about their respective institutions.

March, 2002
Hyderabad

Prasanta Mahapatra,
P. Sridhar, and KT Rajshree

Contents

	Private health sector and state health policy in India. An introduction	1
2	Materials and methods for a study on the structure and dynamics of private health sector in Andhra Pradesh.	7
	Sampling of health care institutions for the study. Data collection formats and the questionnaires. Secondary data analysis and review of literature. Summary of materials and methods	
3	Motivations, establishment, and growth of private health care institutions.	17
	Overseas experience with institutional forms in private sector. Forprofit response to demand for services. Proprietary and corporate health care institutions. Nonprofit health care institutions in the US and other industrialised countries. Indian experience with institutional forms in private sector. Private and voluntary health care institutions in India. Nonprofit HCIs in India. Motivations, establishment, and growth of private health care institutions in AP. Motivating circumstances and incorporation status of Pvt HCIs. Period establishment and growth of HCIs in Andhra Pradesh. Growth in size of HCIs after establishment. Summary of Evidence about institutional forms in health.	
4	Accessibility characteristics of private and public sector HCIs.	35
	Geographic distribution of health care institutions. Review of literature about geographic distribution of health care institutions. Findings from the present study about the geographic spread of private and public HCIs in AP. Socioeconomic character of patients treated by private and public health care institutions. Review of overseas literature about socioeconomic character of patients treated by private and public health care institutions. Review of Indian literature about socioeconomic character of patients treated by private and public health care institutions. Findings from the present study about Socioeconomic character of patients treated by private and public health care institutions. Findings from the present study about accessibility of private and public HCIs. Summary of evidence about accessibility characteristics of private and public HCIs.	

5	Health seeking behaviour and patterns of resort to private or public HCIs.	49
	Factors affecting pattern of resort to different HCIs. Pattern of resort to private and public HCIs for ambulatory care. Pattern of resort to Private and Public HCIs for hospital care. Socio Economic status and Pattern of resort to health care. Summary of evidence about health seeking behaviour.	
6	Efficiency of health care institutions (HCIs) in private sector	61
	Studies comparing efficiency of health care institutions in private forprofit, nonprofit and public sector. Findings from the present study about capacity utilisation by private and public HCIs in AP. Summary of evidence about efficiency of private forprofit, nonprofit and public HCIs.	
7	Quality of care characteristics of private and public health care institutions	69
	A framework for assessment of healthcare quality. Review of overseas literature on healthcare quality and ownership of HCIs. Healthcare quality in private and public HCIs in India. Structure and process quality characteristics of private health care institutions in AP. Premises and floor space. Practice guidelines, and medical records. Patient satisfaction in private and public health care institutions. Owner managers' opinion about interventions for improvement of quality of care in private sector. Summary of evidence about quality of services.	
8	Range of services in private and public health care institutions	97
	Nature of services provided by the private sector and medical interventions where private institutions have an advantage. Findings from the present study about range of clinical services provided by private and public HCIs in Andhra Pradesh. Range of public health related services, participation in national disease control and family welfare programs by private and public HCIs in AP. The healthcare diagnostic services market in AP. Intramural diagnostic services. Extramural diagnostic services. Availability of auxiliary services in private and public HCIs. Summary of evidence about range of services in private and public HCIs.	

9	Human resources and job satisfaction in private and public health care institutions	115
	Staffing and human resource utilisation by private health care institutions in AP. Job satisfaction of health care professionals in private and public sector. Job satisfaction and related concepts. Conceptual basis of the health care professional (HCP) questionnaire. Job satisfaction in private and public HCIs in AP. Summary of findings about human resource utilisation and job satisfaction in private and public health care institutions.	
10	Financial aspects of private HCIs.	131
	Revenue sources for private HCIs. Sources of capital for private health care institutions. Rates and charges. Transparency in rates and charges. Fair financing practices. Summary of findings about financial aspects of private HCIs.	
11	Patient referral, regulatory environment and infrastructure problems faced by private HCIs	149
	Patient referrals. Regulatory environment. Public utility and infrastructure related problems perceived by owner managers of private HCIs. Summary of findings about patient referral, regulatory environment and infrastructure problems faced by private HCIs.	
12	Alternate Private Practitioners in Andhra Pradesh	155
	Summary	
13	Experiences from policy interventions in the United States (US) directed or otherwise affecting the private health sector	163
	Licensing and accreditation. Blue cross insurance plans. Tax waivers for health insurance. Capital Subsidy by US Federal Government for Hospital Construction from 1946-74 under the Hill-Burton Programme. Health Services Planning and Certificate-of-Need (CON) Regulation in the US. Health Maintenance Organizations (HMOs). Peer review and practice guidelines. Summary of the US experience of health policy interventions affecting the private health sector	

14	Policy Recommendations	171
15	Execute Summary	179
	Materials and methods. Motivation, and establishment of private health care institutions. Accessibility character of private and public HCIs. Patterns of resort to private or public HCIs. Efficiency of health care institutions in private sector. Quality healthcare in private and public institutions. Range of services in private and public health care institutions. Human resources utilisation and job satisfaction in health care institutions. Financial aspects of private health care institutions. Patient referral, regulatory environment and infrastructure problems faced by private HCIs. Alternate Private Practitioners. Experiences from the United States (US). Policy Recommendations.	
16	Acknowledgements	195
17	References	197
18.	Appendix	207
	Appendix-1.1 Health Care Institution - Basic Information.	
	Appendix-1.2 Additional questionnaire for owner - managers of private health facilities (Hospitals / Nursing Homes).	
	Appendix-1.3 Health Care Diagnostic Facility Questionnaire.	
	Appendix-1.4 Health Care Professional - Personal Questionnaire.	
	Appendix-1.5 Questionnaire for Alternate Private Practitioner.	
	Appendix-1.6E Patient Exit Interview-English version.	
	Appendix-1.6T Patient Exit Interview-Telugu version	

Tables

#	Table Title	Page
2.1	Sampling plan and number of health care institutions actually surveyed and analysed.....	9
2.2	Questionnaires used to study structure and dynamics of private health sector in AP	11
2.3	SDPHS-AP Expected (Etd) number of questionnaire and actual collection data	12
2.4	Distribution of HCIs by the number of visits required to collect basic information.....	12
3.1	Opening and closure of hospitals in US between 1962-68 by ownership	19
3.2	Change in institutional form of forprofit hospitals in US between 1960-67 by ownership	19
3.3	Distribution of short term hospital capacity in the USA by type of owner-ship	22
3.4	Ownership characteristic of 3421 hospital service areas in the US between 1989 and 1995	23
3.5	Private forprofit and nonprofit health care institutions in selected economi-cally developed countries	23
3.6	Share of private (forprofit and nonprofit) health care institutions in India	25
3.7	Andhra Pradesh - regional and district wise hospitals beds in forprofit and nonprofit health care institutions	26
3.8	Probability of resort to charitable HCIs in India	28
3.9	Motivating circumstances and legal incorporation of private health care institutions in A.P, 2000	28
3.10	Age in years of private and public HCIs in the sample	30
3.11	Growth after inception experienced by private and public health care institu-tions	32
4.1	Differences in availability of private hospital capacity in some developed and backward areas of Andhra Pradesh, 1986	35
4.2	Frequency of "Excellent" rating by patients for convenience of location by private and public HCIs	38

4.3	Uncompensated (Uncomp.) and Medicaid discharges in the US classified by type of ownership of hospitals	40
4.4	Uncompensated care as % of gross patient revenues by ownership type of hospitals in selected states of the US.	41
4.5	% Physicians in US reporting that their hospital discouraged admission of uninsured and Medicaid (poor) patients	42
4.6	Socioeconomic status of patients served by private and public sector HCIs in AP for patient satisfaction surveys (PSS)	43
4.7	Socioeconomically poor patients served by different type of health care institutions. Estimates for all India from morbidity and treatment surveys in NSS 42nd and NSS 52nd rounds.	44
4.8	Socioeconomic status of patients served by private and public sector HCIs in AP	46
4.9	Frequency of "Excellent" rating by patients for access availability questions	47
5.1	Patterns of resort for ambulatory care needs in rural and urban areas in India at different time points, 1986-87 (NSS 42nd), 1993 (NCAER), 1995-96 (NSS 52nd), and 1998-99 (NFHS-2).	51
5.2	Changes between NSS 42nd (1986-87) and 52nd (1995-96) rounds in the pattern of resort to public sector for ambulatory care in India.	52
5.3	Pattern of resort for ambulatory treatment and per capita public expenditure on health in major states. NCAER-1993, and NSS 52nd round, 1995-96	54
5.4	Patterns of resort for ambulatory care to different HCIs by household income and literacy. All India estimates from NCAER survey 1993	55
5.5	Patterns of resort for hospitalisation needs in rural and urban areas in India at different time points, 1986-87 (NSS 42nd), 1993 (NCAER), and 1995-96 (NSS 52nd).	56
5.6	Pattern of resort to government hospitals in various states, 1993 (NCAER) and 1995-96 (NSS).	58
5.7	Patterns of resort to different HCIs by household standard of living index, and rural - urban areas. All India and AP, 1998-99.	59

6.1	Bed occupancy of for profit, nonprofit and publicly owned short term hospitals in the US	61
6.2	Summary of comparative studies of efficiency of forprofit and nonprofit HCIs reviewed by the Institute of Medicine study on forprofit enterprise in health care.	62
6.3	Hospital activity and utilisation indicators of private and public hospitals	66
7.1	Integrated framework for assessment of the quality of health care	74
7.2	Quality of care received by ever married women during their most recent visit to a private or public sector health facility, India, 1998-99	79
7.3	Premises ownership and scale of accommodation of private and public HCIs	81
7.4	Practice guidelines, medical audit and medical records, in HCIs (H = Hospitals)	83
7.5	Patient exit interview - place of interview and respondent characteristics	86
7.6	Patient satisfaction levels in private and public health care institutions	88
7.7	Frequency of "Excellent" or "Very good" rating by patients for each of the 11 items in the quality of service questionnaire	89
7.8	Frequency of "Excellent" rating by patients for each of the 11 items in the quality of service questionnaire	91
7.9	Level of patient satisfaction with respect to specific facilities	92
7.10	Patient response to yes / no questions about quality of services by respective HCIs	92
7.11	Recommendations to improve quality of services in Pvt. HCIs. % Owner-managers reporting that they find the proposed measure very useful or useful	94
8.1	Availability of clinical services in private and public HCIs	101
8.2	Services actually availed by patients sampled for the exit interview ..	102
8.3	Availability of RCH and Imp. Public Health Problem Related Services in private and public HCIs	103
8.4	National programme participation by private and public HCIs	105

8.5	Availability of intramural diagnostic services in private and public HCIs (%)	107
8.6	Usage of extramural diagnostic facilities either entirely or in addition to in-tramural diagnostic facilities	108
8.7	Diagnostic Facility Sample and its Composition	109
8.8	Availability of tests - % of diagnostic facilities reporting availability	110
8.9	Availability of auxiliary services in private and public HCIs (H = Hospitals)	111
9.1	Staffing pattern of private clinics and hospitals (H) in AP, 2000	116
9.2	Prevalence of part time staff in private clinics and hospitals in AP, 2000	117
9.3	Human resource related (HR) problems faced by private HCIs. Percentage HCI owner-managers reporting that they face the respective problem often or very often	118
9.4	Ideal job expectation of health care professionals in private and public sector. % HCPs who view the job characteristic as very important or extremely important.....	122
9.5	Level of job satisfaction of health care professionals in private and public HCIs. % HCPs who perceived that concerned job characteristic met or ex-ceeded their ideal job expectation	125
9.6	Gap between expectation and realisation of job characteristics reported by health care professionals in private and public sectors	127
10.1	Top three sources of income reported by owner-managers of private HCIs (N=146)	133
10.2	Payment related problems faced by private HCIs. Percentage of HCI-Owner or managers reporting that they face the respective problem often or very often.....	134
10.3	Sources of capital and other difficulties for starting up private HCI	135
10.4	Capital investments in private health sector	136
10.5	Credit obstacles faced by private HCIs. Percentage of HCI-owner or manag-ers reporting that they face the respective obstacles severely or very severely	137
10.6	Charges for clinical services by Health Care Institutions. (H = Hospitals)	138

Figures

#	Title	Page
2.1	SDPHS-AP Study: Overview of Sampling design.	7
3.1	Change in motivations for establishment of private health care institutions	29
3.2	Distribution of Sample HCIs and Diagnostic facilities by period of establishment	31
4.1	District Socioeco. dev. index and private hospital beds in AP, 1993-96.	36
4.2	Socioeconomic development index and private hospital beds in districts of AP, except Hyderabad district. 1993-96	37
6.1	Administration as % of total hospital costs, in US, 1994	64
7.1	Health system goals according to a WHO framework, 2000.	70
9.1	Examples of job related questions for health care professionals ..	121